# Appendix D: I&E Peer Review Checklist

**A. I&E Peer Review Checklist Purpose and Instructions**

**1. General**

Peer reviewers should use this checklist to determine (1) whether the Reviewed Organization’s policies and procedures are consistent with or address each of the Blue Book standards, and whether the policies and procedures generally would implement each of the standards; and (2) whether the report selected for review and its associated documentation complied with (a) the Blue Book standards, and (b) the Reviewed Organization’s associated internal policies and procedures. This appendix should be used in conducting both an external peer review (complete sections A and B for all standards) and an external modified peer review (complete only section A for all standards). Generally, a separate checklist should be completed for each set of internal policies and procedures, as well as for each I&E report that is reviewed.

**2. Use of This Checklist**

1. Each section in the checklist corresponds to one of the seven Blue Book standards. To facilitate the review, references to the pertinent Blue Book standards are provided; for additional information and application guidance, the reviewer should refer to the Blue Book.

The overall conclusion as to compliance with each standard should be based on the totality of the information gathered and assessed related to the requirements of that standard. Peer reviewers should not use the checklist to review the Reviewed Organization’s monitoring or oversight of a contracted out I&E if the contractor signed the report and the Reviewed Organization did not endorse or take responsibility for the report. Additional information on peer review responsibilities for reviewing the Reviewed Organization’s monitoring or overseeing contracted out I&Es is available in Section X, “Planning and Performing the External Peer Review,” paragraph 16.

**Review of Policies and Procedures (section A)**

1. In section A of the checklist, the Reviewing OIG should provide a **“Yes,” “No,” or “N/A [Not Applicable],”** answer to each question, reflecting its assessment of the Reviewed Organization’s policies and procedures. The Reviewing OIG also should provide a narrative explanation or comment supporting each determination. If the Reviewing OIG found that the Reviewed Organization’s policies and procedures did not adequately address a standard or a requirement, the Reviewing OIG should ask the Reviewed Organization’s Point of Contact (POC) how the Reviewed Organization’s internal guidance addresses the standard in order to determine whether the guidance is consistent with or adequately addressed the Blue Book. The completed checklist should be included in the peer review project file.

**Review of Reports (section B)**

1. In section B of the checklist, the Reviewing OIG should provide a **“Yes,” “No,” or “N/A [Not Applicable],”** answer to each question, reflecting its assessment of whether the report and project documentation complied with the Blue Book standards and the Reviewed Organization’s policies and procedures. The Reviewing OIG also should provide a narrative explanation or comment supporting each determination. The completed checklist should be included in the peer review project file.
2. For an external modified peer review, the Reviewing OIG should answer each question by considering whether the Reviewed Organization’s policies and procedures (1) are current and (2) if implemented and properly performed, address each of the Blue Book standards.
3. When conducting an external modified peer review of an OIG’s I&E organization that during the 3-year period did not perform and report on I&E projects in compliance with Blue Book standards, the Reviewing OIG should complete section A of the checklist.

**B. I&E Peer Review Coversheet and Checklist**

REVIEWED ORGANIZATION

PERIOD REVIEWED

POLICIES AND PROCEDURES

REVIEWED

REPORT(S)/PROJECT(S)

REVIEWED

NAME OF REVIEWER(S)

DATE COMPLETED

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | **External Modified Peer Reviewꟷcomplete section A only.****External Peer Reviewꟷcomplete sections A and B.** |
| **A** | **1** | **INDEPENDENCE:** Ensures that inspectors, inspection organizations, and their reports are impartial and without bias in both fact and appearance.  |
|  | **Peer Review Questions Pertaining to I&E Policies and Procedures** | **Yes** | **No** | **N/A** | Reviewing OIG References and Comments | Reference/Additional Information Provided by Reviewed OIG | Additional Comments, Actions |
| 1.1 | Are there policies and procedures consistent with the requirement for inspectors and the inspection organization to be independent, both in fact and appearance, in matters relating to inspection work? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1.2 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement that inspectors document all known threats to independence or document that there are no known threats to their independence for each inspection they are assigned to conduct?(This requirement applies to anyone performing or supervising inspection work, to include anyone who may directly influence the outcome of the inspection.) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Overall, are the inspection organization’s policies and procedures consistent with the Independence Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **B** |  | **Peer Review Questions for the Execution and Reporting of I&E Work** | **Yes** | **No** | **N/A** | Reviewing OIG References and Comments | Reference/Additional Information Provided by Reviewed OIG | Additional Comments, Actions |
| 1.1 | Is there documentation or other evidence that the inspectors and inspection organization are independent, both in fact and appearance, in matters relating to this inspection? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1.2 | Is there documentation or other evidence that inspectors documented all known threats to independence or documented that there were no known threats to their independence for this inspection?(This requirement applies to anyone performing or supervising inspection work, to include anyone who may directly influence the outcome of this inspection.) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Overall, did the reviewed report comply with the inspection organization’s internal policies, procedures, and practices consistent with the Independence Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | **Overall, did the reviewed report and its associated documentation comply with the Independence Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | **External Modified Peer Reviewꟷcomplete section A only.****External Peer Reviewꟷ-complete sections A and B.** |
| **A** | **2** | **COMPETENCE:** Ensures that the personnel conducting an inspection collectively have the knowledge, skills, abilities, and experience necessary to conduct the inspection. |
|  | **Peer Review Questions Pertaining to I&E Policies and Procedures** | **Yes** | **No** | **N/A** | Reviewing OIG References and Comments | Reference/Additional Information Provided by Reviewed OIG | Additional Comments, Actions |
| 2.1 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement that inspectors assigned to perform an inspection collectively possess the professional competency to address the inspection objectives and perform the inspection? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2.2 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement that inspectors complete a minimum of 40 hours of training every 2 years? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| If the inspection organization authorizes exemptions to this requirement, do its policies and procedures specify the special circumstances in which it will authorize an exemption such as, but not limited to, part-time employees or employees on extended leave? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2.3 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement that the inspection organization track each inspector’s completed training? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Overall, are the inspection organization’s policies and procedures consistent with the Competence Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |
| **B** |  | **Peer Review Questions for the Execution and Reporting of I&E Work** | **Yes** | **No** | **N/A** | Reviewing OIG References and Comments | Reference/Additional Information Provided by Reviewed OIG | Additional Comments, Actions |
| 2.1 | Did inspectors assigned to perform this inspection collectively possess the professional competency to address the inspection objectives and perform this inspection? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2.2 | Did the inspectors assigned to perform this inspection complete a minimum of 40 hours of training every 2 years? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| If the inspection organization authorized an exemption for any individual assigned to perform this inspection, did it follow its policies and procedures for authorizing the exemption? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2.3 | Did the inspection organization track the completed training of each inspector assigned to this inspection?  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Overall, did the reviewed report comply with the inspection organization’s internal policies, procedures, and practices consistent with the Competence Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | **Overall, did the reviewed report and its associated documentation comply with the Competence Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | **External Modified Peer Reviewꟷcomplete section A only.****External Peer Reviewꟷcomplete sections A and B.** |
| **A** | **3** | **PLANNING:** Ensures that inspectors give attention to the selection of an inspection’s subject matter and the preparation necessary to conduct each inspection. Adequate planning helps ensure that inspectors appropriately research inspection topics. Planning also helps ensure that inspection objectives are clear and adjusted, as appropriate, as the work proceeds. Coordination, research, and work planning should be thorough enough to ensure that inspections will meet inspection objectives. |
|  | **Peer Review Questions Pertaining to I&E Policies and Procedures** | **Yes** | **No** | **N/A** | Reviewing OIG References and Comments | Reference/Additional Information Provided by Reviewed OIG | Additional Comments, Actions |
| 3.1 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to have a basis or rationale for the selection of inspection topics?  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3.2 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to coordinate proposed inspections with appropriate organizations as determined by inspection organization? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3.3 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to research the operation, program, policy, or entity to be inspected? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3.4 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to identify criteria, where applicable, to the operation, program, policy, or entity being inspected to meet the inspection objectives? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3.5 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to have a written inspection plan for each inspection that includes the objective(s), scope, and methodology?  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Overall, are the inspection organization’s planning policies, procedures, and practices consistent the Planning Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |
| **B** |  | **Peer Review Questions for the Execution and Reporting of I&E Work** | **Yes** | **No** | **N/A** | Reviewing OIG References and Comments | Reference/Additional Information Provided by Reviewed OIG | Additional Comments, Actions |
| 3.1 | Did the inspection organization have a basis or rationale for the selection of the inspection topic?  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3.2 | Did the inspection organization coordinate the proposed inspection with appropriate organizations (as determined by the inspection organization)?  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3.3 | Did the inspection organization research the operation, program, policy, or entity inspected? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3.4 | Did the inspection organization identify criteria, where applicable, to meet the inspection objectives? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3.5 | Did the inspection organization prepare a written inspection plan that included the inspection objective(s), scope, and methodology for this inspection? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Overall, did the reviewed report comply with the inspection organization’s internal policies, procedures, and practices consistent with the Planning Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | **Overall, did the reviewed report and its associated documentation comply with the Planning Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | **External Modified Peer Reviewꟷcomplete section A only.** **External Peer Reviewꟷcomplete sections A and B.** |
| **A** | **4** | **EVIDENCE COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS:** Ensures that evidence collected and analyzed is focused on the inspection objectives and supports the findings, conclusions, and recommendations. |
|  | **Peer Review Questions Pertaining to I&E Policies and Procedures** | **Yes** | **No** | **N/A** | Reviewing OIG References and Comments | Reference/Additional Information Provided by Reviewed OIG | Additional Comments, Actions |
| 4.1 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to collect and analyze evidence consistent with inspection objectives and related to the operation, program, policy, or entity being inspected? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4.2 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to include relevant evidence collected and analysis performed in inspection documentation? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4.3 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement that evidence sufficiently and appropriately support inspection findings and provide a reasonable basis for conclusions? 1. Sufficiency is a measure of the quantity of evidence used to support the findings and conclusions related to the inspection objectives. Inspectors should use professional judgment on methods to analyze and interpret evidence to assess its sufficiency. (Application Guidance 4.3a)
2. Appropriateness is the measure of the quality of evidence used to address the inspection objectives and support the findings and conclusions. Appropriate evidence is determined by its relevancy, validity, and reliability. (Application Guidance 4.3c)
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4.4 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to protect controlled unclassified information and classified information? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4.5 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to promptly present information to its supervisors for review and possible referral to the appropriate investigative office when fraud or other illegal acts are suspected? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Overall, are the inspection organization’s evidence collection and analysis policies and procedures consistent with the Evidence Collection and Analysis Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **B** |  | **Peer Review Questions for the Execution of I&E Work** | **Yes** | **No** | **N/A** | Reviewing OIG References and Comments | Reference/Additional Information Provided by Reviewed OIG | Additional Comments, Actions |
| 4.1 | Did the inspectors collect and analyze evidence that is consistent with inspection objectives and related to the operation, program, policy, or entity being inspected? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4.2 | Did the inspectors include relevant evidence collected in inspection documentation? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4.2a | Did the inspectors include analysis performed in inspection documentation? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4.3 | Did the inspectors use evidence that was sufficient and appropriate to support inspection findings?1. Sufficiency is a measure of the quantity of evidence used to support the findings and conclusions related to the inspection objectives. Inspectors should use professional judgment on methods to analyze and interpret evidence to assess its sufficiency. (Application Guidance 4.3a)
2. Appropriateness is the measure of the quality of evidence used to address the inspection objectives and support the findings and conclusions. Appropriate evidence is determined by its relevancy, validity, and reliability. (Application Guidance 4.3c)
 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4.4 | Did the inspectors protect controlled unclassified and classified information? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4.5 | If the inspectors suspected fraud or other illegal acts, did they promptly present information to their supervisors for review and possible referral to the appropriate investigative office? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Overall, did the reviewed report comply with the inspection organization’s internal policies, procedures, and practices consistent with the Evidence Collection and Analysis Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | **Overall, did the reviewed report and its associated documentation comply with the Evidence Collection and Analysis Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | **External Modified Peer Reviewꟷcomplete section A only.****External Peer Reviewꟷcomplete sections A and B.** |
| **A** | **5** | **REPORTING:** Ensures the clear communication of inspection results to those charged with governance, appropriate officials of the inspected entity, other officials charged with oversight of the inspected entity, and, when appropriate, the general public. Inspection reports present factual data accurately, fairly, and objectively and present findings, conclusions, and recommendations in a persuasive manner. |
|  | **Peer Review questions pertaining to I&E policies and procedures.** | **Yes** | **No** | **N/A** | Reviewing OIG References and Comments | Reference/Additional Information Provided by Reviewed OIG | Additional Comments, Actions |
| 5.1 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to state the objective(s), scope, and methodology of the inspection in the inspection report? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to state the findings, conclusions, and recommendations (as appropriate) in the inspection report? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to state that the inspection was conducted in accordance with the Council of the Inspectors General on Integrity and Efficiency’s *Quality Standards for Inspection and Evaluation* in the inspection report? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5.2 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to base report findings, conclusions, and recommendations on the evidence collected and the analysis conducted during the inspection? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5.3 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement that reports include enough information to allow a reasonable person to sustain findings, conclusions, and recommendations? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5.4  | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to address any recommendations made in a report to the appropriate officials who have the authority to act on them? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5.5 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement that formal comments (or a summary thereof) received from the inspected entity on draft inspection report findings, conclusions, and/or recommendations be included in the final report? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5.6 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to distribute inspection reports to the appropriate officials responsible for acting on the findings and recommendations? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Overall, are the inspection organization’s policies and procedures consistent with the Reporting Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **B** |  | **Peer Review Questions for the Execution of I&E Work** | **Yes** | **No** | **N/A** | Reviewing OIG References and Comments | Reference/Additional Information Provided by Reviewed OIG | Additional Comments, Actions |
| 5.1 | Does the inspection report state the objective(s), scope, and methodology of the inspection? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Does the inspection report state the findings, conclusions, and recommendations (as appropriate)? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Does the inspection report state that the inspection was conducted in accordance with the Council of the Inspectors General on Integrity and Efficiency’s *Quality Standards for Inspection and Evaluation*? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5.2 | Did the inspectors base report findings, conclusions, and recommendations on the evidence collected and the analysis conducted during the inspection?(Evidence requirements are defined in the Evidence Collection and Analysis Standard.) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5.3 | Does the inspection report include enough information to allow a reasonable person to sustain the findings, conclusions, and recommendations? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5.4 | Were recommendations made in the report addressed to the appropriate officials who have the authority to act on them? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5.5 | Did the draft inspection report receive formal comments from management officials of the inspected entity on report findings, conclusions, and/or recommendations? If yes, does the final inspection report include those comments or a summary of the comments? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5.6 | Did the inspection organization distribute the report to the appropriate officials responsible for acting on the findings and recommendations? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Overall, did the reviewed report comply with the inspection organization’s internal policies, procedures, and practices consistent with the Reporting Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | **Overall, did the reviewed report and its associated documentation comply with the Reporting Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | **External Modified Peer Reviewꟷcomplete section A only.****External Peer Reviewꟷcomplete sections A and B.** |
| **A** | **6** | **FOLLOW-UP:** Ensures that recommendation follow-up is a shared responsibility between the inspection organization and management officials in the inspected entity. Corrective action taken by management is essential to improving the effectiveness and efficiency of government operations. |
|  | **Peer Review Questions Pertaining to I&E Policies and Procedures** | **Yes** | **No** | **N/A** | Reviewing OIG References and Comments | Reference/Additional Information Provided by Reviewed OIG | Additional Comments, Actions |
| 6.1 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement that inspection organizations solicit management officials’ agreement or disagreement and planned corrective actions for each recommendation in writing? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6.2 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement that inspection organizations monitor the inspected entities’ progress toward implementation of recommendations?  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Overall, are the inspection organization’s policies and procedures consistent with the Follow-up Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **B** |  | **Peer Review Questions for the Execution and Reporting of I&E Work** | **Yes** | **No** | **N/A** | Reviewing OIG References and Comments | Reference/Additional Information Provided by Reviewed OIG | Additional Comments, Actions |
| 6.1 | Did the inspection organization solicit agreement or disagreement and planned corrective actions to the report recommendations from management officials in writing? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6.2 | Did the inspection organization monitor the inspected entities’ progress toward implementation of recommendations? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Overall, did the reviewed report comply with the inspection organization’s internal policies, procedures, and practices consistent with the Follow-up Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | **Overall, did the reviewed report and its associated documentation comply with the Follow-up Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | **External Modified Peer Reviewꟷcomplete section A only.****External Peer Reviewꟷcomplete sections A and B.** |
| **A** | **7** | **Quality Control: Ensures that inspectors and inspection organizations are following Blue Book standards.** |
|  | **Peer Review Questions Pertaining to I&E Policies and Procedures** | **Yes** | **No** | **N/A** | Reviewing OIG References and Comments | Reference/Additional Information Provided by Reviewed OIG | Additional Comments, Actions |
| 7.1 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement to implement a system of quality control that provides the inspection organization with reasonable assurance that the organization and its personnel follow the Blue Book when conducting inspections? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7.2 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement that inspection organizations provide supervision over the inspection work performed? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7.3 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement that inspection organizations that are members of CIGIE undergo an external peer review in accordance with CIGIE requirements? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7.4 | Does the inspection organization have policies and procedures consistent with the requirement that inspection organizations take action if a distributed report is later found to contain findings and conclusions that are not supported by sufficient and appropriate evidence or contains significant errors? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | **Overall, are the inspection organization’s policies and procedures consistent with the Quality Control Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **B** |  | **Peer Review Questions for the Execution and Reporting of I&E Work** | **Yes** | **No** | **N/A** | Reviewing OIG References and Comments | Reference/Additional Information Provided by Reviewed OIG | Additional Comments, Actions |
| 7.1 | Does inspection documentation contain evidence of quality control, providing reasonable assurance that the organization and its personnel followed the Blue Book when conducting the inspection? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7.2 | Did the inspection organization provide supervision over the inspection work performed? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7.3 | Did the inspection organization undergo an external peer review in accordance with CIGIE requirements? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7.4 | If a distributed report later was found to contain findings and conclusions that are not supported by sufficient and appropriate evidence or significant errors, did the inspection organization take appropriate action to ensure that report users did not continue to rely on it? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | **Overall, did the reviewed report comply with the inspection organization’s internal policies, procedures, and practices consistent with the Quality Control Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | **Overall, did the reviewed report and its associated documentation comply with the Quality Control Standard?** |  |  |  |  |  |  |

**END OF CHECKLIST**